

# The Crucified Apostle

Essays on Peter and Paul

Edited by  
Todd A. Wilson and Paul R. House

Mohr Siebeck

TODD A. WILSON, born 1976; Senior Pastor of Calvary Memorial Church in Oak Park, Illinois, USA.

PAUL R. HOUSE, born 1958; Professor of Divinity at Beeson Divinity School, an interdenominational seminary in Birmingham, Alabama, USA.

ISBN 978-3-16-153998-5

ISSN 0512-1604 (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament)

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.dnb.de>.

© 2017 Mohr Siebeck Tübingen. [www.mohr.de](http://www.mohr.de)

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations, microfilms and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The book is typeset by Satz & Sonders in Münster, printed on non-aging paper by Laupp & Göbel in Göttingen and bound by Buchbinderei Nädle in Nehen.

Printed in Germany.

## Table of Contents

Editors' Preface .....	VII
Abbreviations for Journals, Major Reference Works, and Series .....	IX
Abbreviations of Deuterocanonical Works, Pseudepigrapha, Targumic Texts, Apostolic Fathers, and Ancient Texts .....	XIII
Introduction .....	1
<i>Peter Stuhlmacher</i> Reconciled Diversity .....	5
<i>Joel Willitts</i> One Torah for Another. The Halakhic Conversion of Jewish Believers: Paul's Response to Peter's Halakhic Equivocation in Galatians 2:11–21 .....	21
<i>Christopher A. Beetham</i> Eschatology and the Book of Proverbs in 1 Peter .....	47
<i>Paul R. House</i> Scripture, the Day of the Lord, and Holiness. Whole Bible Theology in 2 Peter 3 .....	71
<i>John Dennis</i> Jesus as the Scapegoat. Paul's Atonement Theology in Romans 8:3 in the Context of Romans 5–7 .....	85
<i>Alexander N. Kirk</i> Future Justification in the Golden Chain of Romans 8 .....	107
<i>Douglas C. Mohrmann</i> Paul's Use of Scripture in Romans 9–11 as Palimpsest. Literature in the Second Degree .....	129

*Panagiotis Kantartzis*

- Israel as ἐχθροί and ἀγαπητοί in Romans 11:28. An Isaianic Paradox and Its Pauline Application ..... 151

*Joel White*

- Identifying Intertextual Exegesis in Paul. Methodological Considerations and a Test Case (1 Corinthians 6:5) ..... 167

*Jeff Wisdom*

- Opening the Heart. Compassion and Suffering in Paul's Apostolic Ministry in the Corinthian Correspondence ..... 189

*H. H. Drake Williams III*

- Imitate Me as I Imitate Christ. Considering the Jewish Perspective in Paul's Use of Imitation in 1 Corinthians ..... 209

*William N. Wilder*

- "To Whom Has the Arm of the Lord Been Revealed?" Signs and Wonders in Paul's Isaianic Mission to the Gentiles (Romans 15:18–21 and Galatians 3:1–5) ..... 225

*Todd A. Wilson*

- Scripting and the Rhetoric of Wilderness in Galatians ..... 245

*Wesley Hill*

- The God of Israel – Crucified? Philippians 2:5–11 and the Question of the Vulnerability of God ..... 261

*Sean McDonough*

- Paul and the Semantics of "Justification". Or What Do We Talk about When We Talk about Righteousness? ..... 277

*Elizabeth E. Shively*

- The σωμα and the Transformation of Persons in the Letter to the Romans ..... 297

*Michael Allen*

- Self-Denial ..... 321

- List of Contributors ..... 339

- Scripture Index ..... 343

- Index ..... 359

## Editors' Preface

The editors wish to thank several people for their help. First, we are grateful to Dr. Henning Ziebritzki and the editors of this series for accepting the project for publication and to Klaus Hermannstädter and the staff of Mohr Siebeck for their excellent assistance. Second, we appreciate the fifteen contributors who joined us in this venture for writing stimulating essays on the great apostles Peter and Paul. We particularly thank Prof. Dr. Peter Stuhlmacher for allowing us to include his essay and Wayne Coppins for translating it from German to English. We also thank Chris Beetham for helping with Greek editing. Third, we owe a special debt of gratitude to Heather House, who copy edited the manuscript. The project absolutely could not have been completed without her hard, reliable work. Of course, any remaining mistakes are our responsibility, not hers. Fourth, we thank Calvary Memorial Church, Oak Park, Illinois, and Beeson Divinity School of Samford University, Birmingham, Alabama, for supporting our efforts.

Most of all, we are thankful to our friend and colleague Scott Hafemann for providing the inspiration for this project. Hafemann was Todd Wilson's teacher over fifteen years ago and continues to be an example of scholarship and pastoral engagement to him. They continue their relationship by working together annually at the Center for Pastoral Theology. Hafemann and Paul House have been friends and colleagues since 1986, and their friendship has included scholarly collaboration. All the contributors except Peter Stuhlmacher and Paul House are Hafemann's former students. Working on this project with others who have benefitted from knowing Scott and his wife, Debara, has given the task joy and purpose.

For these and other kindnesses we are very grateful.

Todd Wilson    Paul House

Advent 2016

Within some circles of Judaism, imitation language was used in relation to the imitation of God. Philo in particular speaks frequently of imitating God. The Letter of Aristeas also uses the term in relation to God. A number of quarters from Judaism connect imitation to types of people or particular people. Certain people are worthy of imitation. For instance, Philo encourages readers to emulate Moses. Josephus urges imitation of Noah, David, Jehoshaphat, and the forefathers. First Maccabees and Sirach recommend imitation of a number of noteworthy people who hold to the Law. Sirach indicates that those worthy of imitation are also wise. The writer of the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* encourages the imitation of ideal figures such as Joseph, who feared the Lord and loved his neighbor.

Rather than urging obedience, a Jewish perspective on imitation reveals that the word is employed frequently in relation to godly virtues. These include following the Law, showing courage, displaying wisdom, embracing piety, and demonstrating righteous living. Thus, consideration of the Jewish viewpoint supports Greco-Roman studies of imitation that conclude Paul used imitation language due to his caring relationship with his followers. Some sections of Judaism would also favor the encouragement of family unity, such as Paul emphasizes in 1 Corinthians.

The Jewish perspective also provides a fruitful addition to imitation studies. One portion of intertestamental Jewish thought connects imitation to suffering and unity. Teaching about suffering occurs in the vicinity of imitation in 1 Cor 4:8–13 and also 9:1–27. The Jewish perspective also fits the sacrificial language of the cross, and therefore fits Paul's ethical principles throughout 1 Corinthians. Focusing on a Jewish perspective of imitation can thereby help draw attention to the connection between Christ's suffering, Christian suffering, and ethics that is vital in the Corinthian correspondence.<sup>57</sup>

## "To Whom Has the Arm of the Lord Been Revealed?"

Signs and Wonders in Paul's Isaianic Mission to the Gentiles  
(Romans 15:18–21 and Galatians 3:1–5)

William N. Wilder

In appreciation for Scott Hafemann's life and work, this essay explores one aspect of the apostle Paul's missionary theology. Those familiar with Hafemann's scholarship will know his sustained concern with the topics taken up here: the hard hearts of God's people in the old covenant, Paul's new covenant ministry of the Spirit, and Paul's interpretation of the Old Testament. Those who know his life will be aware that Hafemann's ministry has always been one of both word and works. I hope to relate these themes to Paul's understanding of what Christ had accomplished through him "by word and deed" (Rom 15:18). In particular, I will explore Paul's theological interpretation of the miracles that accompanied his proclamation of the gospel to Jews and gentiles.

This essay will deal principally with Rom 15:18–21 and Gal 3:1–5, passages containing two of Paul's three clear allusions to works of power in his ministry.<sup>1</sup> In both instances an Isaianic background illumines the place of miracles in Paul's new exodus mission to the gentiles. I will make use of Richard Hays's notion of an "allusive echo," in which the "broad interplay" between two texts creates an understanding of the echoed text "beyond those [aspects] explicitly echoed."<sup>2</sup> Specifically, I will argue that Paul's reference to "signs and wonders" in Rom 15:19 evokes God's miraculous deliverance of his people during the exodus, suggesting "unstated or suppressed (transumed) points of reference" between Paul's new exodus allusions to Isa 52:7–53:1 in Romans and Galatians, on the one hand, and Isaiah's reference to "the arm of the Lord" in Isa 53:1b, on the other.<sup>3</sup> Paul nowhere mentions "the arm of the Lord" in his letters, but the very close connection between that phrase and "signs and wonders" in the exodus tradition suggests it is appropriate to include the new exodus miracles to which "the arm of the Lord" refers in its Isaianic (and Old Testament) context within Isaiah's overall influence on Paul. This approach will be particularly fruitful in Gal 3:1–5, where Paul's allusion to Isa 53:1a ("hearing with faith") is best interpreted together with a transumed reference to the revelation of the

<sup>57</sup> See further Scott J. Hafemann, *Suffering and the Spirit: An Exegetical Study of II Cor. 2:14–3:3 within the Context of the Corinthian Correspondence*, WUNT 2.19 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1986).

<sup>1</sup> Craig A. Evans, "Paul the Exorcist and Healer," in *Paul and His Theology*, ed. Stanley E. Porter, Pauline Studies 3 (Leiden: Brill, 2006), 363–64. The other allusion is in 2 Cor 12:12.

<sup>2</sup> Richard B. Hays, *Echoes of Scripture in the Letters of Paul* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1989), 20.

<sup>3</sup> Ibid.

Lord's arm in Isa 53:1b, the arm being understood in terms of the miracles that accompany Paul's Isaianic proclamation of the gospel to the gentiles.

Paul's appropriation of Isa 53:1 is partially analogous to its use in John 12:37–38: the miraculous works that accompany the proclamation of the gospel reveal the present obduracy of Israel just as the revelation of the arm of the Lord during the exodus showed that God had not yet given his people eyes to see or a heart to understand (cf. Deut 29:3). Like Moses (and Jesus), Paul is a suffering mediator of God's power for his people. He is the crucified apostle.<sup>4</sup> In Paul's case, the exodus-like miracles in his mission to the gentiles, together with their response of faith to the gospel, also point to God's promised new exodus deliverance of the nations, though the Galatians risk repeating Israel's insensibility to the signs and wonders in their midst.

"By the Power of Signs and Wonders" (Romans 15:19): Israel's  
Obduracy amidst Miracles in Exodus and Deuteronomy

Paul clearly evokes the exodus with his reference to signs and wonders in Rom 15:19. Paul has just returned to the theme of his apostolic calling to the gentiles that had opened his letter. Having been "set apart for the gospel of God" (1:1) to "bring about the obedience of faith for the sake of his name among all the nations" (1:5), Paul now mentions more specifically what "Christ has accomplished through me to bring the Gentiles to obedience – by word and deed, by the power of signs and wonders, by the power of the Spirit of God" (15:18–19a), so that to a great extent he has "fulfilled the ministry of the gospel of Christ" (15:19b).<sup>5</sup> For Paul, obeying the gospel is inextricably tied to believing what has been heard, the word of Christ preached by the apostles (10:16–17). Such a response of faith and obedience is now evident in Paul's own mission to the gentiles (cf. 15:16), which is thus fulfilling Isa 52:15 (gentiles who have never heard are understanding), with the hope of further fulfillment (to continue preaching the gospel where Christ has not yet been named) (Rom 15:20–21). The surprise, of course – and cause for no little searching of soul and Scripture on Paul's part – is that the gentiles and not Israel are responding to the gospel in faith.

<sup>4</sup> Jacob Jervell is right to insist that while Paul is "a typical charismatic," he is also an "ailing miracle worker" whose "weakness ... belongs to the true life and mark of an apostle" (*The Unknown Paul: Essays in Luke – Acts and Early Christian History* [Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1984], 94). See also Jacob Jervell, "Der Schwache Charismatiker," in *Rechtfertigung: Festschrift für E. Käsemann zum 70. Geburtstag*, ed. J. Friedrich, W. Pöhlmann, and P. Stuhlmacher (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1976), 185–98.

<sup>5</sup> Scriptural citations are taken from the English Standard Version except where otherwise noted.

All this is more or less clear. Much less clear is the sudden appearance of signs and wonders in the context. Where do *they* come from? Even assuming that the presence of miracles in Paul's ministry was not a matter of dispute for the Romans, why mention them here and in such an allusive, even careless, manner? An important clue lies in the unmistakable reference to the exodus story in Paul's phraseology. As J. D. G. Dunn rightly comments:

The overtones and allusions would be clear to his readers: Paul's ministry as continuous with and manifesting the same power/finger of God as every Jew knew to have characterized the Exodus (e.g. Exod 7:3; 8:19); Christ's ministry through Paul in the power of the Spirit as the eschatological equivalent of the epochal ministry of Moses (cf. Matt 12:28/Luke 11:20).<sup>6</sup>

Placing the "signs and wonders" in Paul's ministry within an exodus framework, as Dunn does here, is surprisingly rare. However, if scholars have been right to see the influence of the exodus narrative in Paul's theology,<sup>7</sup> it might seem natural to understand the miracles attending his proclamation of the gospel within that same context. Such an approach does in fact prove fruitful, for noting the actual function of "signs and wonders" in their original exodus setting serves to clarify Paul's conception of their function in his own ministry. That is, signs and wonders most often reveal the obduracy of people to God's work, whether in the hardening of Pharaoh's heart or in the overall insensibility of Israel despite intermittent faith. A brief review of "signs and wonders" in the Old Testament will establish this point.

The first Old Testament usage of "signs and wonders" occurs in Exod 7:3, one of the passages Dunn mentions in the quotation above.<sup>8</sup> God responds to Moses's concern, expressed already at 6:12 and left hanging until its repetition at 6:30: "Behold, I am of uncircumcised lips. How will Pharaoh listen to me?" Having addressed first Moses's sense of his own insufficiency,<sup>9</sup> God

<sup>6</sup> James D. G. Dunn, *Romans 9–16*, WBC 38B (Dallas: Word, 1988), 868.

<sup>7</sup> See, e.g., Sylvia C. Keesmaat, *Paul and His Story: (Re)Interpreting the Exodus Tradition*, JSNTSup 181 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1999); and N. T. Wright, "New Exodus, New Inheritance: The Narrative Substructure of Romans 3–8," in *Romans and the People of God: Essays in Honor of Gordon D. Fee on the Occasion of his 65th Birthday*, ed. Sven K. Soderlund and N. T. Wright (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1999), 26–35. See n. 35 for more references on Paul's use of the exodus narrative in Galatians.

<sup>8</sup> This is the only Hebrew occurrence of "signs and wonders" in Exodus ("my signs and my wonders," *אֲתֵּי אֶת הַמִּטְעָן וְאֶת הַמִּטְעָן*), but some variant of the phrase in Greek appears two other times in this book (7:9, *σημείον ἢ τέρας*; 11:9–10, *μου τὰ σημεῖα καὶ τὰ τέρατα*). In both cases the note of hardheartedness in this phrase is further amplified.

<sup>9</sup> Scott J. Hafemann shows that "according to the LXX, the point of Moses' call is that, although Moses is not *ἐκτενός* to be God's apostle (cf. Exod. 4:10, 12 and 4:13, 28 LXX), God himself has made him sufficient by the promise of his presence (3:12a, 4:12), the giving of a sign (3:12b), and the provision of a miracle-working rod (4:2–9)" (*Paul, Moses, and the History of Israel: The Letter/Spirit Contrast and the Argument from Scripture in 2 Corinthians 3*, WUNT 81 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1995), 50).

then turns to the question of Pharaoh's listening: "But I will harden Pharaoh's heart, and though I multiply my signs and wonders (τὰ σημεῖά μου καὶ τὰ τέρατα) in the land of Egypt, Pharaoh will not listen to you" (7:3-4a). This less-than-heartening answer echoes Exod 4:21 where the Lord commands Moses to show Pharaoh "all the miracles (τὰ τέρατα) that I have put in your power," even though God "will harden his heart, so that he will not let the people go." Even before this, the Lord had told Moses that "the king of Egypt will not let you go unless compelled by a mighty hand" with the result that God himself promises to "stretch out my hand and strike Egypt with all the wonders that I will do in it" (Exod 3:19-20, emphasis added). Already God's wonders and mighty hand are met with an inability (or unwillingness) to see or to understand.

The situation with Israel is a bit different. In response to Moses's skepticism that Israel will believe him (Exod 4:1), the Lord gives Moses three signs "that they may believe" (4:5, cf. vv. 8-9). At first, the signs seem to work. After Aaron "delivered the words of the Lord" on behalf of Moses and "did the signs in the sight of the people," "the people believed" (4:31). Later at the Red Sea, the people respond to God's power ("the mighty hand") with faith: "and they believed in the LORD and in his servant Moses" (14:31). Nevertheless, despite the miracles, the people of Israel constantly revert to doubts, complaints, and rebellion in the wilderness.

Israel's obduracy in Exodus persists right into Deuteronomy, where Moses constantly invokes the "signs and wonders" that were done "before your eyes" as a call to faithfulness and obedience. Note Deut 4:34, which contains the first occurrence of signs and wonders in the book:

Or has any god ever attempted to go and take a nation for himself from the midst of another nation, by trials, by signs, by wonders (ἐν σημείοις καὶ ἐν τέρασιν), and by war, by a mighty hand and an outstretched arm (ἐν χειρὶ κραταιᾷ καὶ ἐν βραχίονι ὑψηλῷ) ... all of which the LORD your God did for you in Egypt before your eyes (ἐνώπιόν σου βλέποντος)?

This question comes in a speech full of Moses's pleas that the people not neglect what they have heard (Deut 4:2, 10, 33, 36, etc.) or forget what they have seen (Deut 4:3, 9, 34). Even as Moses all but predicts their future idolatry and exile, to be followed by their return to the Lord when "you search after him with all your heart and with all your soul" (4:29), he continues to underscore the miracles the Lord did before their eyes, so that they might realize that he alone is God, keep his commandments, and prolong their days in the land.

The use of "signs and wonders" in Deuteronomy 4 illustrates its larger use in Deuteronomy in several ways. To begin with, there is the strong association of "signs and wonders" with the "strong hand and high arm" of the Lord. Each is a formulaic piece of text closely connected to the exodus traditions and

frequently found in conjunction with the other.<sup>10</sup> This continues, in a manner characteristic of Deuteronomy, the conceptual correspondence between signs and wonders and the hand or arm of the Lord that one finds in Exodus and elsewhere.<sup>11</sup>

Furthermore, the visibility of what the Lord has done is crucial, together with the people's responsibility (and ultimately their failure) to remember and consider what he had done before their very eyes. In Deut 6:22 "the Lord showed signs and wonders, great and grievous (σημεῖα καὶ τέρατα μεγάλα καὶ πονηρά) ... before our eyes (ἐνώπιον ἡμῶν/ ἡγιάγῃ)." In 7:19 Moses mentions "the great trials that your eyes saw (οὓς εἶδοσαν οἱ ὀφθαλμοί σου), the signs, the wonders (τὰ σημεῖα καὶ τὰ τέρατα), the mighty hand and the outstretched arm." In Deut 11:2-3 Moses asks the people to consider the Lord's "mighty hand and his outstretched arm, his signs and his wonders (τὰ σημεῖα αὐτοῦ καὶ τὰ τέρατα αὐτοῦ) that he did in Egypt" precisely because he is speaking to those who witnessed the events, "not ... to your children who have not known or seen (οὐχὶ τὰ παῖδια ὑμῶν, ὅσοι οὐκ οἶδασιν οὐδὲ εἶδοσαν) it." Even at the end of the book (34:10-12) Moses is distinguished by "all the signs and the wonders (ἐν πᾶσι τοῖς σημείοις καὶ τέρασιν) the LORD sent him to do in the land of Egypt" and, in the last words of the book, "those great wonders and the mighty hand which Moses performed in the sight of all Israel" (ἐναντι παντὸς Ἰσραὴλ/ -לְכָל יִשְׂרָאֵל; Deut 34:12 Saint Athanasius Academy Septuagint).<sup>12</sup>

The great miracles with which God delivered his people from Egypt are thus meant to be visible signs that elicit faith in the Lord, the only one to whom the wilderness generation owes worship and obedience. This is not to say that such miracles could not be divorced from their intended purpose. In Deuteron-

<sup>10</sup> John William Wevers, *Text History of the Greek Deuteronomy*, MSU 13 (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1978), 91, lists under "strong hand and high arm" nine texts subdivided into five variations: 3:24, 11:2, 4:34, 26:8, 5:15, 6:21, 7:8, 7:19, 9:26. Under "signs and wonders" Wevers, 98, lists ten texts with nine variations: 4:34, 6:22, 7:19, 29:3, 11:3, 13:1, 13:2, 26:8, 28:46, 34:11. The two formulas are found together in the following five passages: Deut 4:34, 6:21-22, 7:19, 11:2-3, 26:8. Interestingly, the two phrases are also found together in the expansionistic A tradition of Deut 29:3 LXX, according to Wevers, *Notes on the Greek Text of Deuteronomy*, Society of Biblical Literature Septuagint and Cognate Studies 39 (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1995), 462, 612.

<sup>11</sup> The two ideas are found together in Exod 3:19-20 (with θαυμάσιος for "wonders"), Ps 78:42-43 (77:42-43 LXX), Jer 32:21 (39:21 LXX), and Bar 2:11. The exodus associations of "signs and wonders" and "the hand (or arm) of the Lord" in Old Testament passages were noted already by, respectively, S. Vernon McCasland, "Signs and Wonders," *JBL* 76 (1957): 150; and F. J. Helfmeyer, *TDOT* 4:134.

<sup>12</sup> In this case "the mighty hand" might be either God's or Moses's. See Exod 4:21 where God commands Moses to "do before Pharaoh all the miracles that I have put in your power (lit. 'your hands') and then constantly throughout the book. Cf. Acts 2:22, 43; 4:29; 5:12; 6:8; 7:36; 14:3; 15:12. Paul too mentions his own agency ("through me") in "what Christ has accomplished" (Rom 15:18).



omy 13 Moses addresses a situation in which "a prophet or dreamer of dreams" gives the people "a sign or wonder" (σημείον ἢ τέρας) to encourage them to "go after other gods, which you have not known" (Deut 13:1–2). In that case the people are called to continued obedience, "for the LORD your God is testing you, to know whether you love the LORD your God with all your heart and with all your soul" (13:3). In any event, the effect of signs and wonders is to reveal the people's heart. The heart revealed, however, is dull and insensible. Although Deuteronomy constantly calls for the people to attend to what their eyes have seen and their ears have heard (that is, to understand that the Lord is their God so that they may prosper in the land), they do not. Ultimately, they do not obey and prosper in the land because they have not sought the Lord or loved him with all their heart (Deut 4:29, 13:3).

The condition of Israel's heart relative to the signs and wonders that have been performed before their very eyes comes to clearest expression in Deut 29:2–4 (29:1–3 MT):

And Moses summoned all Israel and said to them: "You have seen all that the LORD did before your eyes in the land of Egypt, to Pharaoh and to all his servants and to all his land, the great trials that your eyes saw, the signs, and those great wonders (τὰ σημεῖα καὶ τὰ τέρατα τὰ μεγάλα ἐκείνα). But to this day the LORD has not given you a heart to understand or eyes to see or ears to hear" (emphasis added).

The eyes of the people have seen the signs and wonders, yet have remained blind to their significance. A tragic future stretches out before them, but as in Deuteronomy 4 Moses envisions a future after exile in which God's people search after him with their whole hearts. At the same time, it is clear that this change of heart is something that God himself will have to accomplish: "And the LORD your God will circumcise your heart and the heart of your offspring, so that you will love the LORD your God with all your heart and with all your soul, that you may live" (30:6; contrast 10:16).

This brings us to Paul, where the same pattern of thought emerges in his letter to the Romans. I begin with two occasions in chs. 9–11 where Paul appeals to miracle passages from Exodus or Deuteronomy to demonstrate the hardheartedness of Pharaoh or Israel. The first is Paul's quotation of Exod 9:16 in Rom 9:17–18: "For the Scripture says to Pharaoh, 'For this very purpose I have raised you up, that I might show my power in you, and that my name might be proclaimed in all the earth.' So then he has mercy on whomever he wills, and he hardens whomever he wills." Here Paul invokes the example of Pharaoh as Exhibit A in his argument that God has always kept his word through his electing purposes, that is, by having mercy on some and hardening others. In its Old Testament context the hardening of Pharaoh is shown in his resistance to the displays of God's power, the various signs and wonders God has performed through Moses (Exod 9:14, 15, 18, 22, etc.). Paul's mention

of God's "power" here thus anticipates his later reference to signs and wonders.<sup>13</sup>

The second appeal occurs in Rom 11:7–8, where Paul applies to Israel the hardening action of God through a mixed citation of Isa 29:10 and Deut 29:4 (29:3 MT) with a "secondary allusion"<sup>14</sup> to Isa 6:9: "What then? Israel failed to obtain what it was seeking. The elect obtained it, but the rest were hardened, as it is written, 'God gave them a spirit of stupor, eyes that would not see and ears that would not hear, down to this very day.'" What was true of Pharaoh in Rom 9:17 is now clearly affirmed of Israel in 11:8, so that Paul's movement from Pharaoh to Israel in Romans 9–11 follows the trajectory marked out in Exodus from the hardheartedness of Pharaoh to the obduracy of Israel. Moreover, Israel's hardened condition had not changed between Moses's day and Paul's own, as Paul's retention of the phrase "down to this very day" from Deut 29:4 (29:3 MT) indicates. This may imply, as Ross Wagner puts it, that "while Jews and gentiles in Christ have already become sharers in the eschatological deliverance narrated in Deut 30 (see Deut 30:12–14 in Rom 10:6–13; Deut 32:43 in Rom 15:10), 'the rest' of Israel are stuck back in Deuteronomy 29, still blinded and disobedient (Rom 11:8)."<sup>15</sup> Or, perhaps better, Deuteronomy 29 continues to be true for "the rest" of Israel even as the new covenant has dawned for those in Christ.<sup>16</sup> Either way, it is important to remember that the evidence of Israel's hardened condition in Deut 29:4 (29:3 MT) is Israel's lack of faith despite "the great trials that your eyes saw, the signs, and those great wonders (τὰ σημεῖα καὶ τὰ τέρατα τὰ μεγάλα ἐκείνα)" (Deut 29:3 [2]).

Against the backdrop of Rom 9–11 the function of Paul's reference to "signs and wonders" in 15:19 thus becomes clear: it sets up a contrast between the theme of Israel's (and Pharaoh's) hardened condition (amidst signs and wonders), on the one hand, and the coming of gentiles to obedience "by word and

<sup>13</sup> The "strength" (ισχύς) in recensions of Exod 9:16 LXX appears as "power" (δύναμις) in Paul's text, anticipating "the power (δύναμις) of signs and wonders" in Rom 15:19.

<sup>14</sup> Hafemann, *Paul, Moses, and the History of Israel*, 375, notes "the secondary allusion to Is. 6.9 f. (cf. the use of πωρῶν in 11:7)" and concludes that "Isaiah 6:9 f. is thus related to Is. 29:10 and Deut. 29:3 in Rom. 11:7–10 as its conceptual introduction, but is not itself in view in Rom. 11:8" (375 n. 128).

<sup>15</sup> J. Ross Wagner, "Moses and Isaiah in Concert: Paul's Reading of Isaiah and Deuteronomy in the Letter to the Romans," in *As Those Who Are Taught: The Interpretation of Isaiah from the LXX to the SBL*, ed. Claire Mathews McGinnis and Patricia K. Tull, Society of Biblical Literature Symposium Series 27 (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 2005), 100.

<sup>16</sup> Thus Scott J. Hafemann argues from 2 Cor 3:14–15 that "this interpretation of Israel's history [as hardened from the beginning] is reflected in Paul's use of the phrases ἄχρι τῆς σήμερον ἡμέρας [and] ἕως σήμερον (2 Cor 3:14–15), which recall the parallel designation in Deut 29:3 (LXX; MT 29:4) in which Moses declares that, despite the Lord's deliverance, 'the Lord has not given (Israel) a heart to know, and eyes to see, and ears to hear until this day (ἕως τῆς ἡμέρας ταύτης)'" ("Paul and the Exile of Israel in Galatians 3–4," in *Exile: Old Testament, Jewish, and Christian Conceptions*, ed. James M. Scott, Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 56 [Leiden: Brill, 1997], 362). See also Hafemann's *Paul, Moses, and the History of Israel*, 284.

deed" (that is to say, through an understanding and obedient response both to the proclamation of the word *and* to the manifestation of miracles), on the other. Paul's reference to "signs and wonders" in Rom 15:19, along with his earlier citation of Deut 29:4 (29:3 MT) in Rom 11:8, suggests that he attributes a new exodus significance to the miracles that accompany his preaching. In this new exodus it is mainly gentiles who are responding to the gospel while most of Israel continues in its blind and hardened condition. In particular, given his emphasis on the gentiles "seeing and understanding," Paul believes the gentiles to have responded to this new exodus with the kind of understanding and circumscribed hearts that characterize the new covenant.

"Those ... will see ... and understand" (Romans 15:21): Gentile Conversion in Light of Deuteronomy 29–30 and Isaiah 52:7–53:1

Setting Paul's Rom 15:19 reference to signs and wonders within the context of Israel's obduracy also illumines Paul's quotation of Isa 52:15 in Rom 15:21, which Paul cites not just as a rationale for preaching in virgin territory but also as an explanation for what is happening in his mission to the gentiles. The seeing and understanding of the nations in Paul's use of Isa 52:15 stands in stark contrast to the long history of Israel's obduracy, signaled by Paul's reference to signs and wonders only two verses earlier. Now in this citation, in a way typical of him, Paul brings Isaiah in concert with Deuteronomy.<sup>17</sup> While his reference to signs and wonders (Rom 15:19) signals the hardheartedness of Israel, his quotation of Isa 52:15 (Rom 15:21) points to the changed hearts of the gentiles. Indeed, Paul takes Isaiah 52:7–53:1 as God's decisive answer both to the impasse experienced in the first exodus and to the questions raised by Israel's continuing obduracy in this new exodus. On the one hand, God is keeping his promise to unstop ears and open eyes and to do so in a way that extends to the nations (Isa 52:15).<sup>18</sup> On the other hand, not all in Israel have believed what they heard (Isa 53:1a) or had their eyes opened to the new exodus miracles ("the arm of the Lord") revealed among them (53:1b).

To establish the plausibility of this reading for Paul, it is necessary to review the larger context of Isa 52:15 with a view to its overall influence on Paul as well as to his interpretation of the seeing and understanding of gentiles in that

<sup>17</sup> See J. Ross Wagner, *Heralds of the Good News: Isaiah and Paul "In Concert" in the Letter to the Romans*, NovTSup 101 (Leiden: Brill, 2002), 355 n. 42.

<sup>18</sup> Rikki E. Watts "conclude[s] that in the Old Testament specific references to Yahweh's healing of the blind, deaf and lame, understood variously in literal and metaphorical terms, are primarily characteristics of Isaiah's [New Exodus], especially as described in Isaiah 35 (and Isaiah 61)" (*Isaiah's New Exodus and Mark*, WUNT 88 [Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1997], 171–72).

verse. To do so, I will consider Paul's use of Isa 52:7–53:1 in Rom 10:14–17 together with his immediately preceding appeal in that passage to Deut 30:11–14. In Romans 10 and Romans 15, Paul reads Deuteronomy and Isaiah in a highly integrative manner that emphasizes the hearing of God's word and the seeing of his (miraculous) works, along with the change of heart necessary to do so.

There is broad scholarly consensus that Isa 52:7–53:1 was formative in Paul's self-conception as apostle to the gentiles. J. Ross Wagner rightly notes that Paul's citation of Isa 52:7 in Rom 10:15, together with his reference to Isa 52:15 in Rom 15:21, "strongly suggests that careful reflection on this whole passage has helped to shape his own apostolic calling."<sup>19</sup> The storyline of Isa 52:7–53:1, from the sending of a messenger with the glad tidings of new exodus redemption to the hearing of the message and mixed response of faith and obedience, is picked up in Rom 10:14–17 and applied to Paul's own preaching of the gospel with its divergent reception among Jews and gentiles. What is more, Paul links this Isaianic storyline with Deuteronomy. Even as he conceives his role in terms of the "herald of good news" in Isa 52:7–53:1, he links the Isaianic "good news" or "gospel" with the Deuteronomic "word," which is "in your mouth and in your heart" (Deut 30:14).

This linkage of the Isaianic "gospel" with the Deuteronomic "word ... in your heart" is crucial. Three times in Rom 10:5–13 Paul mentions the heart (vv. 6, 8, 10). In Rom 10:6 Paul introduces a character called "the Righteousness-that-is-from-Faith" that begins its quotation of Deut 30:12 in terms drawn from Deut 9:4: "Do not say in your heart ...." The use of this imperative in its original context is instructive: Moses forbids Israel to say in its heart "it is because of my righteousness that the Lord has brought me in to possess this land" (9:4) or, again, that it is "because of your righteousness or the uprightness of your heart" (9:5). In contrast to such self-righteous words "in the heart" (9:4–5) is the affirmation of 30:14, where "the word is very near you ... in your mouth and in your heart." For Paul this "word ... in the heart" is the "word of faith" that he and others ("we") proclaim (Rom 10:8), for it is "with the heart [that] one believes and is justified" (10:10). Here, as earlier in Romans (10:12; cf. 2:28–29;

<sup>19</sup> J. Ross Wagner, "Isaiah in Romans and Galatians," in *Isaiah in the New Testament*, ed. Steve Moyise and Maarten J. J. Menken (London: T&T Clark, 2005), 124. As N. T. Wright notes with respect to Second Isaiah, Paul, "like Jesus, exegeted the text not as matter of theory but as a matter of symbolic vocation" ("The Servant and Jesus: The Relevance of the Colloquy for the Current Quest for Jesus," in *Jesus and the Suffering Servant: Isaiah 53 and Christian Origins*, ed. William H. Bellinger Jr. and William R. Farmer [Harrisburg, PA: Trinity, 1998], 296). C. J. A. Hickling proposed that Paul's attention was drawn to various sections in Isaiah (49–51, 52–55, 9–11) by their perceived relation to his own mission to the gentiles (49:6, 52:7, 9:2, respectively), leading to a broader appropriation on his part of the adjoining columns in the Hebrew scroll ("Paul's Reading of Isaiah," in *Papers on Paul and Other New Testament Authors*, ed. E. A. Livingstone, StudBib 3 [Sheffield: JSOT Press, 1978], 215–23).



3:27–31), it is faith and a changed heart that mark the eschatological people of God, justifying the inclusion of the gentiles.

What occurs then in Rom 10:5–13, which clearly depends on Paul's reading of Deuteronomy, is "the theology of God's eschatological work in the heart, since Deut 30. 6 speaks of the 'circumcision of the heart,' which Jer. 31.31 identifies with the New Covenant."<sup>20</sup> In the place of a heart that asserts its own righteousness (Deut 9:4; Rom 10:6) is a circumcised heart (Deut 30:6; cf. 10:16) that responds with faith to the word that actually resides there (Deut 30:14; Rom 10:8; cf. Jer 31:31). The new covenant has thus been inaugurated, at least for the nations. In the meantime, and even as the gentiles respond to the gospel, Israel remains without "a heart to understand or eyes to see or ears to hear" (Deut 29:4 [3]). Or, in response to Isaiah's question (Isa 53:1a), which Paul quotes in Rom 10:16 ("Who has believed our report?"), one may say, "the gentiles," since they have heard the gospel and responded in faith, indicating that God has given them a heart to understand. Conversely, most of Israel remains hardened "down to this very day" (Rom 11:8; Deut 29:4 [29:3 MT]; cf. 2 Cor 3:15), though in the end "all Israel shall be saved" (Rom 11:26).

This brings us back to Paul's citation of Isa 52:15 in Rom 15:21. Here Paul draws from the same section in Isaiah (52:7–53:1) to justify his "ambition to preach the gospel, [but] not where Christ has already been named" (Rom 15:20). Paul's commission as a herald of the good news is clear enough, along with the continuing primacy of the proclaimed word. At the same time the emphasis on the nations here, both in Isaiah and in Paul, is best understood against the failure to hear and to see that so characterized the first exodus of Israel, now overcome in the new covenant and the new exodus of the nations. For as Wagner has noted:

the language of Isaiah 52:15 concerning "seeing" and "hearing" reminds the reader of the paradox of Israel's obduracy, over which Paul has agonized most poignantly in Romans 9–11. While the Gentiles, through Paul's preaching, are now seeing, hearing, and understanding, Israel has "heard," but has not believed the message (Rom. 10:16–18). God has given them "eyes that do not see and ears that do not hear, to this very day" (Rom. 11:8 [Isa. 29:10 and Deut. 29:3]; see 11:10). The resonance of Isaiah 52:15 with this larger theme of Romans suggests that Paul has found his own ministry inextricably linked with the paradoxical outworking of God's redemptive purpose.<sup>21</sup>

<sup>20</sup> Roy E. Ciampa, "Deuteronomy in Galatians and Romans," in *Deuteronomy in the New Testament*, ed. S. Moyise and M. J. J. Menken (London: T&T Clark, 2007), 99–117, citing E. E. Ellis, *Paul's Use of the Old Testament* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 1957), 123 n. 1.

<sup>21</sup> J. Ross Wagner, "The Heralds of Isaiah and the Mission of Paul," in *Jesus and the Suffering Servant: Isaiah 53 and Christian Origins*, ed. William H. Bellinger Jr. and William R. Farmer (Harrisburg, PA: Trinity, 1998), 201–02. See also Richard B. Hays, "Who Has Believed our Message? Paul's Reading of Isaiah," in *The Conversion of the Imagination: Paul as Interpreter of Israel's Scripture* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2005), 39–40; and Eugene R. Ekblad Jr., *Isaiah's Servant Poems According to the Septuagint: An Exegetical and Theological Study*, CBET 23 (Leuven: Peeters, 1999),

Wagner's point finds further substantiation in Paul's immediately preceding reference to "signs and wonders," which has already brought the obduracy – amidst – miracles theme from the exodus tradition into play. Here in Romans 15, as in Romans 10, Paul understands his mission to the gentiles in the light of his reading of Deuteronomy and Isaiah. These passages also demonstrate the way in which he finds the continued obduracy of Israel and the receptivity of the gentiles in those texts.

At the same time a new dimension of Paul's reading of these texts emerges in Romans 15. In Romans 10 and 15 as indeed generally, Paul privileges the proclamation of the gospel together with the hearing, believing, and the condition of the heart that may or may not accompany it. In terms of Isa 53:1a, quoted in Rom 10:16, the question has been "Who has *believed* what he *heard* from us?" Romans 15, however, offers a glimpse of what Paul believes may be *seen* in the mission to the gentiles. He does so in dependence on the emphasis on seeing (or not seeing) that he finds in Deuteronomy and Isaiah and with a deep sense of the connection between seeing and exodus – like miracles. Thus, in accordance with Isaiah's prophecy that "those who have never been told will see" (Rom 15:21), Paul's proclamation of the gospel has been accompanied "by the power of signs and wonders" (15:19). In this way the gentiles have been brought to obedience "by word and deed" (15:18) in a way that addresses, at least for the gentiles, the failure to see and to understand in Deut 29:4 (29:3 MT) in terms of the new exodus answer to obduracy promised in Isa 52:15.

This account of Paul's intertextual reading of Deuteronomy and Isaiah, particularly against the backdrop of the obduracy – amidst – miracles theme traced above in Exodus and Deuteronomy, raises an interesting question: Did Paul find in the programmatic Isa 52:7–53:1 passage a reference to the miracles that would be seen and understood (by the gentiles) in the Isaianic new exodus, or is this notion of the miraculous simply imported from elsewhere, via his understanding of "signs and wonders" in the exodus tradition? Put otherwise, was Paul's self-understanding as apostle to the gentiles shaped by Isa 52:7–53:1, not only with respect to his role as a "herald of good news" and his experience of the gentiles' hearing and understanding but also with respect to the performance of new exodus miracles?

The answer, I contend, is that Paul did find miracles in the Isaianic new exodus and that he did so by way of a robust reading of the "arm of the Lord" in its immediate and larger contexts. I have already noted the strong association of signs and wonders with the arm of the Lord in Exodus and Deuteronomy. Note that the arm of the Lord evokes the exodus and brings to mind the miraculous in its own right. In a detailed study of the hand/arm of God in the exodus

189. Cf. Rikki E. Watts, "The Meaning of 'ālāw yīpāṣū mēlāktīm pīhem in Isaiah lli 15," VT 40 (1990): 335.

traditions, David Rolph Seely concluded that "the expressions of hand of God imagery known from the Exodus maintain throughout the Bible a distinctive theology of the power of God to *miraculously* intervene in the affairs of men."<sup>22</sup> The same may also be said of Isaiah 51–63, with respect to which H. L. Ginsberg long ago noted "the unusual concentration of locutions in which the arm of YHWH figures."<sup>23</sup> Here too Seely concludes that the occurrences "of these hand/arm expressions in Isaiah ... in the context of the future Restoration evoke the same power manifested before only in the Exodus and emphasize the truly *miraculous* nature of such events."<sup>24</sup>

Indeed, these exiles in Isa 52:7–53:1 include the same link between seeing and miracles that I have already noted in Exodus and Deuteronomy.<sup>25</sup> The emphasis on speaking and hearing in Isa 52:7–53:1 is accompanied by an equally strong emphasis on seeing, from the watchmen who see with their own eyes "the return of the LORD to Zion" (52:8) to the baring of the Lord's "holy arm before the eyes of all nations" so that "all the ends of the earth shall see the salvation of our God" (52:10). Here the seeing is extended to the nations and has as its object the arm of the Lord. Given the strong new exodus character of Second Isaiah along with the reference to the arm of the Lord in both 52:10 and 53:1, it should not be surprising that the Targum takes the object of seeing in Isaiah 52 to be the new exodus miracles that accompany the proclamation of the good news: "for with their eyes they will see the wonders (גְּבוּרָתוֹ) that the Lord will do when he returns his shekinah to Zion" (Tg. Isa. 52:8 Targum E).<sup>26</sup> Accordingly, it is not uncommon in later Jewish commentaries to interpret the Isaianic new exodus of Israel in this passage in such miraculous terms.<sup>27</sup> One may even con-

<sup>22</sup> David Rolph Seely, "The Image of the Hand of God in the Exodus Traditions" (PhD diss., University of Michigan, 1990), 212 (emphasis added). See also *ibid.*, 147–48.

<sup>23</sup> H. L. Ginsberg, "Critical Notes: The Arm of YHWH in Isaiah 53–63 and the Text of Isa 53:10–11," *JBL* 77 (1958): 152. See also Bernhard W. Anderson, "Exodus Typology in Second Isaiah," in *Israel's Prophetic Heritage: Essays in Honor of James Muilenburg*, ed. Bernhard W. Anderson and Walter Harrelson (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1962), 183.

<sup>24</sup> Seely, "The Image of the Hand of God," 212 (emphasis added).

<sup>25</sup> According to *ibid.*, 196, the people's responsibility to remember and consider the exodus signs and wonders is also generally true of the hand/arm imagery in the Old Testament.

<sup>26</sup> A form of the Aramaic word for "wonders" in Isa 52:8 (גְּבוּרָתוֹ) is also attached to the "arm of the LORD" (רֶכֶס גְּבוּרָתָא רִיז) in Isa 53:1b. See also Tg. Isa. 53:8 where exodus-like "miracles" are envisaged: "Out of sufferings and retribution he will bring our exiles near. Miracles that will be done for us in his days, who will be able to tell?"

<sup>27</sup> Thus, e.g., the thirteenth-century R. Y'Sha'yah Ben Mali glosses Isa 53:1b "upon whom hath the arm of the Lord been revealed" with "to do *wonders and signs* for them as he has done for Israel?" (emphasis added), in Samuel Rolles Driver and Adolf Neubauer, *The Fifty-Third Chapter of Isaiah according to the Jewish Interpreters* (Oxford: James Parker, 1877), 75. Also in *ibid.*, 206–7, R. Sa'adyah Ibn Danan applies Isaiah 53 to Hezekiah and, having referred to "the signs and wonders which [God] wrought" on Hezekiah's behalf in his interpretation of 52:15, continues along the same lines in his exposition of 53:1: "But even if what had happened in the former days (i.e., the fall of the Assyrians) were told them, *who would believe a report* such as that would be or *upon whom* of the nations was the arm of the Lord ever revealed to work for them a miracle so great as this?"

clude that it is most natural to interpret the arm of the Lord as an exhibition of miraculous power, in keeping with the exodus tradition in general and the Isaianic new exodus in particular. Understood in this way, Isa 53:1 recapitulates the themes of new exodus hearing and seeing in Isa 52:7–53:1 even as it queries the extent of both: "Who has believed what he heard from us [that is, with respect to the hearing of the gospel]? To whom has the arm of the Lord been revealed [that is, with respect to the seeing of miracles]?"

Admittedly, this interpretation of the arm of the Lord in Isaiah runs against a strong current of traditional Christian exposition. A long history of interpretation from the earliest church fathers to the present day has identified "the arm of the Lord" in Isa 53:1b with the suffering servant in the rest of the chapter. Isa 53:1b even becomes the hermeneutical key that unlocks the messianic meaning of the arm of the LORD elsewhere in Scripture. In typical fashion Augustine interprets Ps 71:18 (70:18 LXX) by quoting the psalm itself, followed by a citation of Isa 53:1 and the climactic christological conclusion: "'Forsake not me, until I tell forth Thine arm to every generation that is yet to come.' And the Arm of the Lord hath been revealed to whom? The Arm of the Lord is Christ."<sup>28</sup> Modern interpreters continue to make the same equation in Isaiah, where, for example, Alec Motyer argues at Isa 51:9 that "the 'Arm of the Lord' is not someone/something apart from the Lord but is the Lord himself," concluding then at 53:1 that "now at last the arm has come."<sup>29</sup>

Nevertheless, there is good reason to insist on Paul's obduracy – amidst – miracles interpretation of Isa 53:1. In addition to the fact that the arm of the

<sup>28</sup> Augustine, *Expositions on the Book of Psalms* 71.21, NPNF<sup>1</sup> 8:32. Cf. Ps 86:11 (85:11 LXX) where Augustine (*ibid.*, 415) pastorally expositis the God's "leading" to be a leading by the *hand*, which is then referred to Christ through Isa 53:1. For other examples of this procedure see Augustine's interpretations of 89:12 LXX (*ibid.*, 444) and Ps 98:1 (97:1 LXX) (*Expositions*, 480); Jerome's interpretation of Ps 89:12 LXX; Exod 15:6, per Mark Elliott, ed., *Isaiah 40–66*, ACCS Old Testament 11 (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2007), 157; and Luther's interpretation of Ps 17:7 in Martin Luther, "The Pious and Learned Commentary of Martin Luther on the First Twenty-Two Psalms," in vol. 4 of *Select Works of Martin Luther: An Offering to the Church of God in the Last Days*, trans. Henry Cole (London: T. Bensley, 1826), 168. The identification of the arm of the Lord with Christ was well enough established by the late second century for Tertullian to use it as an argument for the separate personhood of the Son within the Godhead (*Prax.*, 607–08).

<sup>29</sup> J. Alec Motyer, *The Prophecy of Isaiah: An Introduction and Commentary* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1993), 427. Ekblad, *Isaiah's Servant Poems*, 192, argues that Isa 52:10 "prepares the reader to interpret the servant as his holy arm and salvation that comes from God." See also John N. Oswalt, *The Book of Isaiah: Chapters 40–66*, NICOT (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1998), 382; Catrin Williams, "The Testimony of Isaiah and Johannine Christology," in *As Those Who Are Taught: The Interpretation of Isaiah from the LXX to the SBL*, ed. Claire Mathews McGinnis and Patricia K. Tull, Society of Biblical Literature Symposium Series 27 (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 2005), 122; Wagner, "Heralds of Isaiah," 213; Rodrigo Jose Morales, *The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel: New Exodus and New Creation Motifs in Galatians*, WUNT 2.282 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2010), 83; and Matthew S. Harmon, *She Must and Shall Go Free: Paul's Isaianic Gospel in Galatians*, BZNW 168 (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2010), 68, 70.

Lord points most obviously to miracles in the exodus tradition, this interpretation also has a clear and early witness in the Gospel of John, lending further support to the reading of Isaiah attested in the Targums and other later Jewish interpretation. This brings us to John 12:37–38, which summarizes the unbelief of the people despite Jesus's many signs: "Though he had done so many signs before them, they still did not believe in him, so that the word spoken by the prophet Isaiah might be fulfilled: 'Lord, who has believed what he heard from us, and to whom has the arm of the Lord been revealed?'" Here near the end of the Book of Signs (1:19–12:50), John summarizes the effect of Jesus's ministry, with special attention to his miracles, by quoting both halves of Isa 53:1.<sup>30</sup> The first half (v. 1a) laments the people's failure to believe the gospel while the second half (v. 1b) uses "the arm of the Lord" to refer to the signs that have accompanied Jesus's proclamation of that gospel.<sup>31</sup> This is then an early and straightforward division of Isa 53:1 into the hearing of the gospel and the seeing of miracles, lending credence to the notion that Paul understood Isa 53:1 in the same way, that is to say, "by word and deed" (Rom 15:18).

John 12 also features the same placement of signs (and the arm of the Lord) within the obduracy tradition in the Old Testament exodus traditions and Paul. Several interpreters have detected within John's juxtaposition of signs and unbelief in John 12:37 an intriguing similarity to Moses's words in Deut 29:2–4 (1–3).<sup>32</sup> Some also connect this passage with John's citation of the obduracy judgment in Isa 6:9–10.<sup>33</sup> Indeed, it appears we have here, as in Paul, a reading of Isa 53:1, Deut 29:2–4, and Isa 6:9–10 in concert. All three are read within the obduracy context, while the first two are read with reference to the place of miracles in the midst of that obduracy. Finally, the larger influence of Isaiah 52–53 on John 12 has been repeatedly explored. Of particular interest is the suggestion that the request of the Greeks seeking Jesus ("Sir, we wish to see Jesus," John 12:21) has been shaped with specific reference to the seeing and understand-

<sup>30</sup> The special attention to the signs (and the failure to see them) is indicated both by John's introductory focus on Jesus's "having done so many signs among them" (John 12:37) and his subsequent omission of any reference to hearing or ears from his quotation of Isa 6:9–10 (John 12:40).

<sup>31</sup> Raymond E. Brown notes "that the passage very nicely covers the whole of Jesus' ministry, both his words ('what we have heard') and his works or signs (what has been effected by the Lord's might or 'arm' – this expression is used in Deut v 15 in describing God's agency in the signs of the Exodus)" (*The Gospel According to John I–XII*, AB 29 [New York: Doubleday, 1966], 485). See also R. C. H. Lenski, *The Interpretation of John's Gospel* (Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1942), 886.

<sup>32</sup> Brown, *John I–XII*, 485; D. A. Carson, *The Gospel According to John* (Leicester: InterVarsity Press, 1991), 447 n. 37; Craig L. Blomberg, *The Historical Reliability of John's Gospel: Issues and Commentary* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2001), 184; and J. Ramsay Michaels, *The Gospel of John*, NICNT (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2010), 705 n. 5.

<sup>33</sup> Brown, *John I–XII*, 486. See also George R. Beasley-Murray, *John*, WBC 36, 2nd ed. (Waco, TX: Nelson, 1999), 216.

ing of the nations in Isa 52:15.<sup>34</sup> In John as in Isaiah, the obduracy judgment in Isa 6:9–10 is reversed in the seeing granted here, though (ironically) it is so for the gentiles and not Israel.

To sum up, Paul's reference to signs and wonders in Rom 15:19, along with his earlier allusion to Deut 29:4 (29:3 MT) in Rom 11:8, indicates that he attributes a new exodus significance to the miracles that accompany his preaching. In particular, his emphasis on the gentiles' seeing and understanding suggests that he believes the gentiles to have responded to this new exodus with the kind of understanding heart that characterizes the new covenant. Paul thus understands Isa 52:15 not only as a mandate to enlarge the scope of his Gentile mission but also as a reference to the response of the gentiles vis-à-vis Israel.

Furthermore, I want to suggest that Paul found a reference to the exodus-like signs and wonders in his mission to the gentiles in the programmatic Isa 52:7–53:1, where the arm of the Lord is revealed. In agreement with the usage of the arm of the Lord in the exodus tradition, Paul interprets its occurrence in Isa 53:1b in parallel with the signs and wonders in that same exodus tradition. This illumines Paul's understanding of Isa 52:7–53:1, where in a very short span Paul finds a prefiguration of his own apostolic mission, a reference to the seeing and understanding of the gentiles, an indication of their response of faith to what they hear (in his mission to them), and the new exodus place of miracles with that proclamation (in the revealing of the arm of the Lord).

But with all this, what if a largely gentile congregation shows itself to be foolish and unseeing despite the miracles in its midst? For the answer I turn now to Gal 3:1–5.

#### Miracle-Working and the "Hearing of Faith" (Galatians 3:1–5): Obduracy or Faith amidst Miracles?

The mix of elements in Gal 3:1–5 confirms a new exodus understanding of miracles in Paul's mission to the gentiles. Many, including Hafemann, have made much of Paul's new exodus theology in Galatians, not to mention the influence of Isaiah in that letter.<sup>35</sup> Now, in light of the discussion above, note the promi-

<sup>34</sup> See Daniel J. Brendsel who claims that "the ability to see and understand [in 52:15] ... speaks the reversal of the obduracy judgment of Isa 6:9–10" ("Isaiah Saw His Glory": The Use of Isaiah 52–53 in John 12," BZNW 208 [2014]: 55); and, per Brendsel, Torsten Uhlig, *The Theme of Hardening in the Book of Isaiah: An Analysis of Communicative Action*, FAT 239 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2009), 246. Cf. Johannes Beutler, "Greeks Come to See Jesus (John 12:20f)," *Bib* 71 (1990): 345; and Williams, "The Testimony of Isaiah," 120.

<sup>35</sup> For the importance of the exodus in Paul's argument to the Galatians, see James M. Scott, *Adoption as Sons of God: An Exegetical Investigation into the Background of ΥΙΟΘΕΣΙΑ in the Pauline Corpus*, WUNT 2.48 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1992), 121–86; Hafemann, "Paul and the

nence of miracles in this passage (3:5), the repeated use of obduracy language with respect to the Galatians (3:1, 3), and the twofold echo of Isa 53:1a (the "hearing with faith" in 3:2, 5). The effect is stupefying: according to Paul, the Galatians risk their own version of Israel's obduracy amidst miracles despite the initial evidence that they had believed the gospel. "I am perplexed about you," Paul later exclaims (4:20), and no wonder.

Paul's twice-repeated echo of Isa 53:1a is crucial. In Gal 3:2, 5 Paul asks whether the Galatians had experienced miraculous exhibitions of the Spirit "by works of the law" (ἐξ ἔργων νόμου) or "by hearing with faith" (ἐξ ἀκοῆς πίστεως). There is no need to enter into the debate about the proper translation of ἐξ ἀκοῆς πίστεως. More significant for our purposes is the probability of an allusion to Isa 53:1. As Matthew Harmon points out, "The combination of ἀκοή and πίστις appears nowhere in the LXX, but in Isa 53:1 the verb πιστεύω does appear with the noun ἀκοή, the only place in the LXX where the two occur together."<sup>36</sup> Of course, Paul himself combines the noun ἀκοή and the noun πίστις in just one other place: his interpretation of Isa 53:1 in Rom 10:16–17. Matthew Harmon and Karen Jobes both adduce other echoes of Isaiah in the immediate and larger context of Galatians, thus increasing the likelihood of an echo of Isa 53:1 in this case.<sup>37</sup>

If my thesis is correct, then Paul's echo of Isa 53:1a in Gal 3:2, 5 "places the reader within a field of whispered or unstated correspondence," helpfully amplified for readers of Paul's subsequent (explicit and non-explicit) citations in Romans.<sup>38</sup> In particular, Paul's use of "hearing with faith" (ἀκοῆς πίστεως) suggests that his later answer in Romans to the question posed by Isa 53:1 ("Lord, who has believed our report?" Not hardened Israel! [Rom 10:16]) is already in play in his letter to the Galatians and, in view of the obduracy language here ("O foolish Galatians!"), being applied in a highly polemical fashion to the Judaizing gentiles in his Galatian congregation. In addition, the strong emphasis on miracles in Gal 3:1–5 at the beginning of an argument that moves from

Exile of Israel," 329–71; Sylvia C. Keesmaat, "Paul and His Story: Exodus and Tradition in Galatians," in *Early Christian Interpretation of the Scriptures of Israel: Investigations and Proposals*, ed. Craig A. Evans and James A. Sanders, JSNTSup 148 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1997), 300–33; William N. Wilder, *Echoes of the Exodus Narrative in the Context and Background of Galatians 5:18*, StBibLit 23 (New York: Lang, 2001), 82–105; Todd A. Wilson, "Wilderness Apostasy and Paul's Portrayal of the Crisis in Galatia," NTS 50 (2004): 550–71; and Morales, *The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel*, 82–83.

<sup>36</sup> Harmon, *She Must and Shall Go Free*, 130.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid.; and Karen H. Jobes, "Jerusalem, Our Mother: Metalepsis and Intertextuality in Gal 4:21–31," WTJ 55.2 (1993): 312–13.

<sup>38</sup> Hays, *Echoes of Scripture*, 20. See also Stanley E. Porter, "Further Comments on the Use of the Old Testament in the New Testament," in *The Intertextuality of the Epistles: Explorations of Theory and Practice*, ed. Thomas L. Brodie, Dennis R. MacDonald, and Stanley E. Porter (Sheffield: Sheffield Phoenix, 2006), 107.

Abrahamic promise to new exodus fulfillment<sup>39</sup> adds credence to the notion that Paul draws on Isa 53:1b to interpret the miracles attending his portrayal of the gospel. I am arguing, then, in light of Paul's explicit reference to exodus-like "signs and wonders" in Rom 15:19 and his repeated mention of miracles in Gal 3:2, 5, together with the evidence that Isa 52:7–53:1 is the backdrop against which he is communicating, that Paul is viewing the experience of his Galatian congregation through the lens of Isa 53:1a and b. New exodus signs and wonders have occurred (v. 1b). These were associated with an initial "hearing with faith" (v. 1a), which Paul had taken as an indication of their new exodus deliverance (Gal 3:2, 5). Are the Galatians actually identifying themselves with Israel's ephemeral faith and historical hardheartedness instead?

The miraculous character of these manifestations is thus central to Paul's appeal.<sup>40</sup> Despite occasional attempts to downplay or reinterpret the miraculous element here,<sup>41</sup> it is clear that Paul is appealing to the mighty works experienced by the Galatians. As Hans Dieter Betz observes, "δύναμις in connection with ἐνεργεῖν points to the occurrence of miracles."<sup>42</sup> Furthermore, Paul's comparable reference to "deeds of power" (ἐνεργήματα δυνάμεων) in 1 Cor 12:10 should probably be understood as exorcisms, related to healings,<sup>43</sup> suggesting that the "working of miracles" (ἐνεργῶν δυνάμεις) in Gal 3:5 should be understood along the same lines. The relation of such healings to eschatological restoration in

<sup>39</sup> Thus, e.g. Hafemann, "Paul and the Exile of Israel," 366: "For against the backdrop of Paul's understanding of the hardened nature of 'the present Jerusalem' and the promise of the restoration of Jerusalem from exile in Isaiah 54:1, the Jerusalem from 'above' that is 'free' is a reference to the 'second Exodus' inauguration in Christ of the new covenant of the new creation. Isaiah 54:1, and Paul's use of it here, thus picks up the use of the 'second Exodus' motif to portray Israel's restoration from exile as developed throughout Isaiah."

<sup>40</sup> Galatians 3:1–5 parallels Paul's argument in the Corinthian correspondence, as Scott J. Hafemann shows in remarks on 2 Cor 3:3: "For the fact that the Spirit was present in the hearts of the Corinthians, far from being hidden and indiscernible, was publicly recognizable, open and evident to any who joined their worship, as 1 Cor. 12 and 14 make abundantly clear" (*Suffering and the Spirit: An Exegetical Study of II Cor. 2:14–3:3 within the Context of the Corinthian Correspondence*, WUNT 2.19 [Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1986], 202). Hafemann goes on to note the parallel to Gal 3:1–5, which he takes to be "the very heart of Paul's argument in Galatians" (202 n. 95).

<sup>41</sup> Jobes claims, for example, that "Paul grounds his argument not in the subjective experience of the Galatian churches, but in the canonical prophecy given by Isaiah" ("Jerusalem, Our Mother," 312).

<sup>42</sup> Hans Dieter Betz, *Galatians: A Commentary on Paul's Letter to the Churches in Galatia*, Hermina (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1979), 135 n. 78.

<sup>43</sup> Guy Williams argues that the "gifts of healing" in 1 Cor 12:9 "constitute spirit-adjurations" while "deeds of power" in 12:10 (and thus in Gal 3:5) are exorcisms, which are "the most common and visible manifestation of power known to us from early Christian texts and [make] a good pairing with healings (cf. 12:28)" (*The Spirit World in the Letters of Paul the Apostle: A Critical Examination of the Role of Spiritual Beings in the Authentic Pauline Epistles*, FRLANT 231 [Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2009], 257). See also Graham Twelftree, *Paul and the Miraculous: A Historical Reconstruction* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2013), 23; and James D. G. Dunn, *Jesus and the Spirit: A Study of the Religious and Charismatic Experience of Jesus and the First Christians as Reflected in the New Testament* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1975), 210.



Deuteronomy, Isaiah, Paul, and the Gospels has also been noted. Brian Rosner points to the "association of healing with the restoration of God's people" in Deuteronomy and 1 Corinthians.<sup>44</sup> Craig Evans emphasizes the way in which "Isaiah's good tidings entail healing and restoration" in the Gospels.<sup>45</sup>

Healing in general is part of the demonstration of the powerful presence of God and his rule, not only because it was part of the eschatological promise of Isaiah (cf. Isa 26:19; 35:5-6; 61:1-2 in Matt 11:5 = Luke 7:22; 4:16-30; and in 4Q521), but because there is evidence that some of the healings were linked in various ways to exorcism, or at least to the demonic world.<sup>46</sup>

Thus, the specific manifestation of signs and wonders in the Pauline and other early Christian congregations was likely viewed in light of the restoration healings seen in Deuteronomy and Isaiah. While the signs and wonders in the first exodus were cosmological in nature, for Paul, as well as for Isaiah, the revelation of the arm of the Lord was set within a new exodus context marked by release from (demonic) captivity, along with the healing of the lame, the blind, and the deaf.<sup>47</sup>

What is more, this healing by way of release from spiritual oppression extends to the heart in early Christian conception. Craig Keener points to the way in which in his Gospel "John uses literal blindness to teach principles about spiritual blindness (9:39-41)."<sup>48</sup> John Painter claims that for John such spiritual blindness is "because the prince of this world, the power of darkness, had blinded their eyes and hardened their hearts."<sup>49</sup> Paul too knows that the god of this world blinds people (2 Cor 4:4) and it is likely that he saw in the exorcisms and healings occurring among his congregations an indication of an

<sup>44</sup> Brian Rosner, "Deuteronomy in 1 and 2 Corinthians," in *Deuteronomy in the New Testament*, ed. S. Moyise and M. J. J. Menken (London: T&T Clark, 2007), 120.

<sup>45</sup> Craig A. Evans, "From Gospel to Gospel: The Function of Isaiah in the New Testament," in *Writing and Reading the Scroll of Isaiah: Studies of an Interpretive Tradition*, ed. Craig C. Broyles and Craig A. Evans, VTSup 70 (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 2:656. Cf. Eric Eve, *The Jewish Context of Jesus' Miracles* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 2002), 380, who also notes the metaphorical and literal dimensions of healing in the larger Jewish context of Jesus's miracles.

<sup>46</sup> Craig A. Evans, "Inaugurating the Kingdom of God and Defeating the Kingdom of Satan," *BBR* 15 (2005): 73.

<sup>47</sup> Cf. Watts, who makes a similar point with respect to the Gospel of Mark: "Just as in the [Isaianic New Exodus] the deliverance and healing of Israel was the precursor to her return along the way to restored Zion-Jerusalem so too Mark, prior to his 'Way' section, presents Jesus in terms of the Yahweh-Warrior who delivers the captives from demonic bondage, as Israel's healer, and as the one who forgives her sins" (*Isaiah's New Exodus and Mark*, 139-40).

<sup>48</sup> Craig S. Keener, *The Gospel of John: A Commentary* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2003), 2:883.

<sup>49</sup> John Painter, "The Quotation of Scripture and Unbelief in John 12:36b-43," in *The Gospels and the Scriptures of Israel*, ed. Craig A. Evans and W. Richard Stegner, JSNTSup 104 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1994), 458. See also, e.g., T. Dan 5:11, quoted in Evans, "Inaugurating the Kingdom," 62, where God's release of those who are captive to Beliar is parallel to the promise that he "shall turn the hearts of the disobedient ones to the Lord."

even deeper restoration. In line with Isaiah the physical healings pointed beyond themselves to the deeper healing and release that God was accomplishing among his people. Ultimately, they pointed to the way in which God was giving the gentiles (though not yet to Israel as a whole) eyes to see and ears to hear and a heart to understand. This seems to be the point in John 12 as well.

If something like this is the case, then Paul's bewilderment in Gal 3:1-5 comes into focus. Given the Galatians' return to circumcision, Paul wonders if the gospel has been proclaimed and signs and wonders revealed among them to no effect. Despite exorcisms that should indicate the defeat of the enemies of God's people, the Galatians seem bewitched by magic or demons (Gal 3:1).<sup>50</sup> Despite healings that should point to spiritual as well as physical restoration, the Galatians seem blind to the significance of the miracles attending Paul's preaching, not to mention the portrayal of Christ in the preaching itself. Paul's reference to the Galatians' failure to see despite the portrayal of Christ crucified "before your eyes" invokes not only the obduracy of Israel during the exodus but also suggests that the crucifixion itself is the great exodus deliverance to which the Galatians have been so astoundingly blind. Their eyes have seen this portrayal of the gospel and other exhibitions of God's power among them, though it may be without "a heart to understand or eyes to see or ears to hear" (Deut 29:4 [3]). This then explains Paul's twice-repeated suggestion that the Galatians are "foolish" (ἄνοητοι), a description that must be placed firmly within the obduracy tradition traced here and to which Paul himself later refers in Romans.<sup>51</sup>

It is also possible that Paul uses his epithet for the Galatians advisedly. The one LXX use of ἄνοητοι ("foolish") is found in Deut 32:31 where Moses describes the foolish gentiles: "For not like our God are their gods, but our enemies are without understanding (ἄνοητοι)." In Deuteronomy 32 Israel has become as foolish and bereft of understanding as the nations who are void of understanding (vv. 6, 21, 28, 29, 31), so God will make them "jealous of those who are not a nation" and "make them angry with a foolish nation" (v. 21 in Rom 10:19). Paul thus seems to fear that the Galatians have become not just like foolish Israel but like the foolish gentiles who worship other gods.<sup>52</sup> To call the Galatians

<sup>50</sup> See Bruce W. Longenecker, "'Until Christ is Formed in You': Suprahuman Forces and Moral Character in Galatians," *CBQ* 61 (1999): 92-108.

<sup>51</sup> Thus Wilson need not except Gal 3:1-5 from his generalization that "when directly addressing the Galatians, Paul regularly uses language or imagery drawn from the wilderness traditions" ("Wilderness Apostasy and Paul's Portrayal of the Crisis in Galatia," 553 n. 12). It seems rather to confirm that pattern, and also extend Paul's opening amazement at the Galatians (Gal 1:6), which was "intended to evoke the apostasy of the wilderness generation" (*ibid.*, 558).

<sup>52</sup> J. G. McConville notes the "subtle interplay between the accusation of the enemy and that of Israel in [Deuteronomy 32] vv. 28-35. ... If the enemy is foolish because of its inadequate gods, it must not be forgotten that Israel, too, is foolish because it has spurned Yahweh" (*Deuteronomy*, ApOTC 5 [Leicester: Apollos, 2002], 457-58). Philo, *Fug.* 123, actually uses the Greek word for "foolishness" (ἄνοητος) here with reference to Deut 29:3 LXX, though in a highly rationalistic man-

ἀνόητοι, then, is to invoke the obduracy tradition in the Old Testament, perhaps Deuteronomy in particular. It may suggest that the Galatians have returned to their foolish Gentile condition (Deuteronomy 32), turning back to those that are not gods (Gal 4:8) and making God's people their enemies, not least Paul himself (Gal 4:16).

In the end, however, Paul remains hopeful for the Galatians. He grants them an Isaianic "hearing with faith" in Gal 3:2, 5, though with some question as to its durability. More fundamentally, he speaks of God sending the Spirit of his Son "into our hearts" (4:6), apparently including the Galatians in this reception of the Spirit as well as the associated sonship. The answer to the problem of blind eyes and hard hearts is found in God's promises in Deuteronomy 30, Jeremiah 31, and Ezekiel 11, 37. With respect to Gal 4:6 J. Louis Martyn is right to note that Paul here "embraces [this] motif established by the Hebrew prophets. Both Jeremiah and Ezekiel contrast obdurate and immutable stone with the malleable and permeable human heart (the will, passion, the intellect), using this contrast to envision a renewal of Israel by God's effective invasion of the human being."<sup>53</sup> For Paul as for the prophets this work of eschatological renewal was a work of the Spirit, both with respect to human hearts and its outworking in the changed lives of his converts. Ultimately, he calls the Galatians to live out the freedom of being led by the Spirit in the path of love, exhibiting the fruit of the Spirit (5:22) in the revived wilderness of the new exodus.<sup>54</sup>

None of this, it must be said, excludes a place for those other exhibitions of the Spirit that indicated the arrival of the Isaianic new exodus. For Paul, to appeal to the miracles that follow the preaching of the gospel, whether here or in Romans 15, is just one more way of indicating the outworking of God's eschatological purposes in Christ. Drawing on a wide array of Old Testament passages, none more important than Isa 52:7–53:1, Paul sees in Rom 15:18–19 and Gal 3:1–5 the new exodus deliverance accomplished by the crucified Christ, his own role as an apostolic herald of that good news to the gentiles, and, amazingly, the assemblage of nations redeemed from bondage, led by the Spirit, and on the way to their filial inheritance. Signs and wonders attend their way. As the positive answer to Isaiah's questions (53:1), they have believed the report and the miraculous arm of the Lord has been revealed to them.

ner: "For, as Moses says, 'such men have not hearts to understand, nor eyes to see, nor ears to hear,' but make the whole of their life blind, and deaf, and senseless (ἀνόητον) and mutilated in every respect."

<sup>53</sup> J. Louis Martyn, *Galatians*, AB 33A (New York: Doubleday, 1997), 391.

<sup>54</sup> Wilder, *Echoes of the Exodus*, 215. See also Wilson, "Wilderness Apostasy and Paul's Portrayal of the Crisis in Galatia," 570 n. 90.

## Scripting and the Rhetoric of Wilderness in Galatians

Todd A. Wilson

Social movements, like the Pauline mission communities in first-century Asia Minor, are often fueled by a stockpile of stories that provide participants a sense of common identity and shared purpose. One example is the scriptural account of Israel's exodus from Egypt and subsequent journey through the wilderness on route to the land of promise.<sup>1</sup> This particular set of narratives has been remarkably versatile and potent, thus serving as "a narrative template for innumerable movements of liberation and revolution over the centuries in the West."<sup>2</sup>

Martin Luther King Jr., the iconic leader of the American civil rights movement, consistently used these narratives to invigorate his powerful rhetoric of freedom.<sup>3</sup> Part of his genius as a communicator was his ability to *script* his hearers into the role of those who had experienced an exodus deliverance and were now making their way through the wilderness to the land of promise. King used these narratives to encourage and exhort his followers in their arduous yet righteous quest. Invoking Israel's wilderness journey, King admonished his audience, "Keep moving. Let nothing slow you up."<sup>4</sup>

In his study of King's civil rights speeches, Gary S. Selby observes, "King's language symbolically placed his hearers within the drama, inviting them to imagine that they were, literally, the children of God enacting the Exodus in their present experience." As King said on one occasion, resonating with things he said on many occasions, "The Red Sea has opened for us, we have crossed the banks, we are moving now. ... We are going on because we've got to get to Canaan."<sup>5</sup>

What was the impact of King's use of these narratives on his hearers? According to first-hand accounts, people were not only swept up in the emotion of the moment, but also into the narrative world invoked by alluding to this set of stories. King's hearers "underwent a vivid, immediate, and transformative experience of being 'in' the story itself."<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup> It is a privilege to dedicate this essay to Dr. Scott Hafemann, teacher, mentor, and friend, who first taught me how to read the Greek New Testament and fueled both my scholarly interests and pastoral calling. Unless otherwise noted, all Scriptural quotations are from the English Standard Version.

<sup>2</sup> Christian Smith, *Moral, Believing Animals: Human Personhood and Culture* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003), 75.

<sup>3</sup> Cf. Gary S. Selby, *Martin Luther King and the Rhetoric of Freedom: The Exodus Narrative in America's Struggle for Civil Rights* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2008).

<sup>4</sup> Cited in *ibid.*, 9.

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.*, 86.

<sup>6</sup> *Ibid.*, 170.